# Infection prevention and control measures for Ebola and Marburg Virus disease: A series of rapid reviews

#### KQ11 Disinfection – Disinfection of hands or gloves - Initial Summary (Version 1, 20 July 2022)

Nicole Shaver, nicole.shaver@uottawa.ca, Knowledge Synthesis and Application Unit, School of Epidemiology and Public Health, Faculty of Medicine, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada. ORCID 0000-0003-3210-8895

Ba' Pham, ba.pham@theta.utoronto.ca, Li Ka Shing Knowledge Institute, St. Michael's Hospital, Unity Health Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada

Alexandria Bennett, d.bennett@uottawa.ca, Knowledge Synthesis and Application Unit, School of Epidemiology and Public Health, Faculty of Medicine, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada. ORCID 0000-0002-5977-2094

Andrew Beck, andrew.beck@uottawa.ca, Knowledge Synthesis and Application Unit, School of Epidemiology and Public Health, Faculty of Medicine, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada. ORCID 0000-0002-8308-2202

Becky Skidmore, bskidmore@rogers.com, Independent Information Specialist, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada.

Maura R. Grossman, maura.grossman@uwaterloo.ca, University of Waterloo, Waterloo, Ontario, Canada.

Gordon V. Cormack, gvcormac@uwaterloo.ca, University of Waterloo, Waterloo, Ontario, Canada.

Sharmistha Mishra, Sharmistha.Mishra@toronto.ca, Department of Medicine, St. Michael's Hospital, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada;

MAP Centre for Urban Health Solutions, Li Ka Shing Knowledge Institute, Unity Health Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada;

Epidemiology Division and Institute of Health Policy, Management, and Evaluation, Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada;

Institute of Medical Science, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada. ORCID: 0000-0001-8492-5470

Adrienne Chan, adrienne.chan@sunnybrook.ca, Sunnybrook Health Sciences Centre, Toronto; Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada.

Lan Xu, lan.xu@sjtu.edu.cn, School of Medicine, Shanghai Jiao Tong University, China.

David Moher, dmoher@ohri.ca, Knowledge Synthesis and Application Unit, School of Epidemiology and Public Health, Faculty of Medicine, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada.

Melissa Brouwers, Melissa.Brouwers@uottawa.ca, Knowledge Synthesis and Application Unit, School of Epidemiology and Public Health, Faculty of Medicine, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada.

Andrea C. Tricco, Andrea.Tricco@unityhealth.to, Li Ka Shing Knowledge Institute, St. Michael's Hospital, Unity Health Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada; Epidemiology Division and Institute of Health Policy, Management, and Evaluation, Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada; Queen's Collaboration for Health Care Quality Joanna Briggs Institute Centre of Excellence, Queen's University, Kingston, Ontario, Canada.

Julian Little, jlittle@uottawa.ca, Knowledge Synthesis and Application Unit, School of Epidemiology and Public Health, Faculty of Medicine, University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada.

**Funding:** Funding for this protocol and the subsequent reviews was provided by the World Health Organization (Funding # 202818287). The working group (WG) from the WHO/HQ Country Readiness Strengthening Health Care Readiness Unit will be consulted to develop and refine the scope, and review and approve the protocol. The WG will not be involved in the conduct of the review including selection of studies and data analysis but will advise as needed on priority population(s), interventions, and outcomes in an iterative process during the review process based on the available evidence. The WG will also comment on the draft report and provide input on interpretations of findings. AT is funded by a Tier 2 Canada Research Chair in Knowledge Synthesis. SM is funded by a Tier 2 Canada Research Chair in Mathematical Modeling and Program Science.

**Competing interests:** DM was involved in the 2015 rapid review by Hersi et al. [1] There are no other competing interests to acknowledge.

**Acknowledgements:** We thank Kaitryn Campbell, MLIS, MSc (St. Joseph's Healthcare Hamilton/McMaster University) for peer review of the Embase search strategy.

#### Key Questions

Question (11)-(a): Should health workers providing direct or indirect care to patients with Ebola or Marburg disease in ETUs and healthcare facilities wash hands (soap & water) OR wash the glove (soap & water) between patients?

Question (11)-(b): Should health workers providing direct or indirect care to patients with Ebola or Marburg disease in ETUs and healthcare facilities disinfect hands with ABHR OR disinfect the glove with ABHR between patients?

Question (11)-(c): Should health workers providing direct or indirect care to patients with Ebola or Marburg disease in ETUs and healthcare facilities disinfect hands (with chlorine) OR disinfect the glove (with chlorine) between patients?

### Methods Summary

This is one of a series of rapid reviews answering 12 key questions related to three themes on infection prevention and control measures for filoviruses: (i) transmission/exposure (n=3 questions), (ii) personal protective equipment (PPE) (n=5), and (iii) decontamination and disinfection (n=4). Data sources include Medline, Embase, bio/medRxiv pre-print servers, Global Medicus Index, Epistemonikos, China National Knowledge Infrastructure (CNKI) and Wangfang database. We used an automation tool (CAL® tool) for titles/abstracts screening for relevant systematic reviews and primary comparative studies. Full-text screening, data extraction, risk of bias assessment, and GRADE (Grading of Recommendations Assessment, Development and Evaluation) for the certainty of evidence were completed independently by two reviewers with any disagreements resolved by consensus, with arbitration by a third reviewer, when needed.

## **Findings**

A total of 250 studies were screened in the CAL tool software and 39 studies were included for fulltext screening. No studies met the eligibility criteria (Appendix 2) for any of the three key questions. A list of excluded studies with reasons for exclusion can be found in Appendix 1.

Although no studies met the eligibility criteria for appropriate interventions and comparators, we noted evidence that addressed hand hygiene protocols for health care workers handling highly infectious diseases. Suen and colleagues<sup>1</sup> performed a simulation study to compare contamination when hand washing with soap and water was performed before/after each PPE doffing step (outer gloves, inner gloves, and bare hands) versus when the removal of both gloves was followed by hand washing with soap and water. Other evidence in this area includes the 2020 Cochrane systematic review by Verbeek and colleagues<sup>2</sup> that included evidence on simulated contamination for ABHR for glove sanitization vs. no glove sanitization. Two excluded studies examined relevant outcomes for varying doffing protocols with ABHR before/after each stage of glove doffing (outer gloves, inner gloves)<sup>3,4</sup>. Finally, several studies<sup>5–7</sup> were found that compared the effectiveness of different types of disinfectant agents for disinfection, including soap and water vs. ABHR vs. chlorine solutions<sup>6,7</sup>.

#### **References:**

- 1. Suen LKP, Guo YP, Tong DWK, et al. Self-contamination during doffing of personal protective equipment by healthcare workers to prevent Ebola transmission. *Antimicrob Resist Infect Control.* 2018;7(1):157. doi:10.1186/s13756-018-0433-y
- Verbeek JH, Rajamaki B, Ijaz S, et al. Personal protective equipment for preventing highly infectious diseases due to exposure to contaminated body fluids in healthcare staff. Cochrane Work Group, ed. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev.* Published online April 15, 2020. doi:10.1002/14651858.CD011621.pub4
- 3. Mumma JM, Durso FT, Ferguson AN, et al. Human Factors Risk Analyses of a Doffing Protocol for Ebola-Level Personal Protective Equipment: Mapping Errors to Contamination. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2018;66(6):950-958. doi:10.1093/cid/cix957
- Casanova LM, Erukunuakpor K, Kraft CS, et al. Assessing Viral Transfer During Doffing of Ebola-Level Personal Protective Equipment in a Biocontainment Unit. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2018;66(6):945-949. doi:10.1093/cid/cix956
- Casanova LM, Teal LJ, Sickbert-Bennett EE, et al. Assessment of Self-Contamination During Removal of Personal Protective Equipment for Ebola Patient Care. *Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol*. 2016;37(10):1156-1161. doi:10.1017/ice.2016.169
- Wolfe MK, Gallandat K, Daniels K, Desmarais AM, Scheinman P, Lantagne D. Handwashing and Ebola virus disease outbreaks: A randomized comparison of soap, hand sanitizer, and 0.05% chlorine solutions on the inactivation and removal of model organisms Phi6 and E. coli from hands and persistence in rinse water. Cameron DW, ed. *PLOS ONE*. 2017;12(2):e0172734. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0172734
- Wolfe MK, Wells E, Mitro B, Desmarais AM, Scheinman P, Lantagne D. Seeking Clearer Recommendations for Hand Hygiene in Communities Facing Ebola: A Randomized Trial Investigating the Impact of Six Handwashing Methods on Skin Irritation and Dermatitis. Cameron DW, ed. *PLOS ONE*. 2016;11(12):e0167378. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0167378

#### Appendix 1. Excluded Studies List – By Reason for Exclusion:

Not a relevant study (Neither Ebola, Marburg, nor a relevant surrogate outcome (COVID-19)

Haque M. Handwashing in averting infectious diseases: Relevance to COVID-19. *jptcp*. 2020;27(SP1):e37-e52. doi:10.15586/jptcp.v27SP1.711

Omess S, Kaplow R, Green A, et al. Implementation of a Warm Zone Model During the COVID-19 Pandemic. *AJN, American Journal of Nursing.* 2021;121(1):48-54. doi:10.1097/01.NAJ.0000731664.58705.c3

#### No information on the type of hand hygiene method

Kwon JH, Burnham CAD, Reske KA, et al. Assessment of Healthcare Worker Protocol Deviations and Self-Contamination During Personal Protective Equipment Donning and Doffing. *Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol.* 2017;38(9):1077-1083. doi:10.1017/ice.2017.121

Ratnayake R, Ho LS, Ansumana R, et al. Improving Ebola infection prevention and control in primary healthcare facilities in Sierra Leone: a single-group pretest post-test, mixed-methods study. *BMJ Glob Health*. 2016;1(4):e000103. doi:10.1136/bmjgh-2016-000103

#### Population not of interest

Cook B, Cutts T, Nikiforuk A, et al. Evaluating Environmental Persistence and Disinfection of the Ebola Virus Makona Variant. *Viruses.* 2015;7(4):1975-1986. doi:10.3390/v7041975

Cutts TA, Robertson C, Theriault SS, et al. Efficacy of microbicides for inactivation of Ebola– Makona virus on a non-porous surface: a targeted hygiene intervention for reducing virus spread. *Sci Rep.* 2020;10(1):15247. doi:10.1038/s41598-020-71736-x

Gallandat K, Lantagne D. Selection of a Biosafety Level 1 (BSL-1) surrogate to evaluate surface disinfection efficacy in Ebola outbreaks: Comparison of four bacteriophages. Galdiero M, ed. *PLoS ONE*. 2017;12(5):e0177943. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0177943

Gidado S, Oladimeji AM, Roberts AA, et al. Public Knowledge, Perception and Source of Information on Ebola Virus Disease – Lagos, Nigeria; September, 2014. *PLoS Curr*. Published online 2015. doi:10.1371/currents.outbreaks.0b805cac244d700a47d6a3713ef2d6db

Lantagne D, Wolfe M, Gallandat K, Opryszko M. Determining the Efficacy, Safety and Suitability of Disinfectants to Prevent Emerging Infectious Disease Transmission. *Water*. 2018;10(10):1397. doi:10.3390/w10101397

Squire JS, Conteh I, Abrahamya A, et al. Gaps in Infection Prevention and Control in Public Health Facilities of Sierra Leone after the 2014–2015 Ebola Outbreak. *TropicalMed.* 2021;6(2):89. doi:10.3390/tropicalmed6020089

#### Irrelevant method of disinfection

Cutts TA, Ijaz MK, Nims RW, Rubino JR, Theriault SS. Effectiveness of Dettol Antiseptic Liquid for Inactivation of Ebola Virus in Suspension. *Sci Rep.* 2019;9(1):6590. doi:<u>10.1038/s41598-019-42386-5</u>

Cutts TA, Nims RW, Theriault SS, Bruning E, Rubino JR, Ijaz MK. Hand hygiene: virucidal efficacy of a liquid hand wash product against Ebola virus. *Infection Prevention in Practice*. 2021;3(1):100122. doi:10.1016/j.infpip.2021.100122

Eggers M, Eickmann M, Kowalski K, Zorn J, Reimer K. Povidone-iodine hand wash and hand rub products demonstrated excellent in vitro virucidal efficacy against Ebola virus and modified vaccinia virus Ankara, the new European test virus for enveloped viruses. *BMC Infect Dis.* 2015;15(1):375. doi:10.1186/s12879-015-1111-9

#### No comparator

Lim SM, Cha WC, Chae MK, Jo IJ. Contamination during doffing of personal protective equipment by healthcare providers. *Clin Exp Emerg Med.* 2015;2(3):162-167. doi:<u>10.15441/ceem.15.019</u>

Reidy P, Fletcher T, Shieber C, et al. Personal protective equipment solution for UK military medical personnel working in an Ebola virus disease treatment unit in Sierra Leone. *J Hosp Infect*. Published online 2017.

#### No relevant comparisons

Abdulsalam M, Ibrahim A, Michael G, Mijinyawa A. Hand washing practices and techniques among health professionals in a tertiary hospital in Kano. 2015;10(1):5.

Buregyeya E. Leveraging ebola viral disease emergency preparedness for infection prevention and control in health care facilities. *International Journal of Infectious Diseases*. 2020;101:318. doi:10.1016/j.ijid.2020.09.829

Casanova LM, Erukunuakpor K, Kraft CS, et al. Assessing Viral Transfer During Doffing of Ebola-Level Personal Protective Equipment in a Biocontainment Unit. *Clinical Infectious Diseases*. 2018;66(6):945-949. doi:10.1093/cid/cix956

Casanova LM, Teal LJ, Sickbert-Bennett EE, et al. Assessment of Self-Contamination During Removal of Personal Protective Equipment for Ebola Patient Care. *Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol.* 2016;37(10):1156-1161. doi:10.1017/ice.2016.169

Hopman J, Kubilay Z, Allen T, Edrees H, Pittet D, Allegranzi B. Efficacy of chlorine solutions used for hand hygiene and gloves disinfection in Ebola settings: a systematic review. *Antimicrob Resist Infect Control.* 2015;4(S1):O13. doi:10.1186/2047-2994-4-S1-O13

Jacquerioz Bausch FA, Heller O, Bengaly L, et al. Building Local Capacity in Hand-Rub Solution Production during the 2014-2016 Ebola Outbreak Disaster: The Case of Liberia and Guinea. *Prehosp Disaster med.* 2018;33(6):660-667. doi:10.1017/S1049023X18000985

Kanagasabai U, Enriquez K, Gelting R, et al. The Impact of Water Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) Improvements on Hand Hygiene at Two Liberian Hospitals during the Recovery Phase of an Ebola Epidemic. *IJERPH*. 2021;18(7):3409. doi:10.3390/ijerph18073409

Kubilay Z, Hopman J, Allen T, Edrees H, Allegranzi B. Skin side effects of chlorine solutions used for hand hygiene: a systematic review. *Antimicrob Resist Infect Control.* 2015;4(S1):P9, 2047-2994-4-S1-P9. doi:10.1186/2047-2994-4-S1-P9

Mallow M, Gary L, Jeng T, et al. WASH activities at two Ebola treatment units in Sierra Leone. Ikegami T, ed. *PLoS ONE*. 2018;13(5):e0198235. doi:<u>10.1371/journal.pone.0198235</u>

Mumma JM, Durso FT, Casanova LM, et al. Common Behaviors and Faults When Doffing Personal Protective Equipment for Patients With Serious Communicable Diseases. *Clinical Infectious Diseases*. 2019;69(Supplement\_3):S214-S220. doi:10.1093/cid/ciz614

Ogoina D, Oyeyemi AS, Ayah O, et al. Preparation and Response to the 2014 Ebola Virus Disease Epidemic in Nigeria—The Experience of a Tertiary Hospital in Nigeria. Warburton D, ed. *PLoS ONE*. 2016;11(10):e0165271. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0165271

Siddharta A, Pfaender S, Vielle NJ, et al. Virucidal Activity of World Health Organization– Recommended Formulations Against Enveloped Viruses, Including Zika, Ebola, and Emerging Coronaviruses. *The Journal of Infectious Diseases*. 2017;215(6):902-906. doi:10.1093/infdis/jix046

Suen LKP, Guo YP, Tong DWK, et al. Self-contamination during doffing of personal protective equipment by healthcare workers to prevent Ebola transmission. *Antimicrob Resist Infect Control.* 2018;7(1):157. doi:10.1186/s13756-018-0433-y

Tantum LK, Gilstad JR, Bolay FK, et al. Barriers and Opportunities for Sustainable Hand Hygiene Interventions in Rural Liberian Hospitals. *IJERPH*. 2021;18(16):8588. doi:10.3390/ijerph18168588

Verbeek JH, Rajamaki B, Ijaz S, et al. Personal protective equipment for preventing highly infectious diseases due to exposure to contaminated body fluids in healthcare staff. Cochrane Work Group, ed. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. Published online April 15, 2020. doi:10.1002/14651858.CD011621.pub4

Wells E, Wolfe MK, Murray A, Lantagne D. Accuracy, Precision, Ease-Of-Use, and Cost of Methods to Test Ebola-Relevant Chlorine Solutions. Munster VJ, ed. *PLoS ONE*. 2016;11(5):e0152442. doi:<u>10.1371/journal.pone.0152442</u>

Wolfe MK, Gallandat K, Daniels K, Desmarais AM, Scheinman P, Lantagne D. Handwashing and Ebola virus disease outbreaks: A randomized comparison of soap, hand sanitizer, and 0.05% chlorine solutions on the inactivation and removal of model organisms Phi6 and E. coli from hands and persistence in rinse water. Cameron DW, ed. *PLoS ONE*. 2017;12(2):e0172734. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0172734

Wolfe MK, Wells E, Mitro B, Desmarais AM, Scheinman P, Lantagne D. Seeking Clearer Recommendations for Hand Hygiene in Communities Facing Ebola: A Randomized Trial Investigating the Impact of Six Handwashing Methods on Skin Irritation and Dermatitis. Cameron DW, ed. *PLoS ONE*. 2016;11(12):e0167378. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0167378

## PDF Unavailable

Garibaldi BT, Rainwater-Lovett K, Pilholski T, et al. Transmission of fluorescent aerosolized particles in a clinical biocontainment unit. *American Journal of Respiratory and Critical Care Medicine Conference: American Thoracic Society International Conference ATS*. Published online 2017.

Kratz T, Verbeek L. Discussion of two infection prevention and control training approaches to enhance biosafety in primary healthcare facilities during an outbreak of Ebola virus disease. *Tropical Medicine and International Health.* Published online 2017.

Ibeneme S, Maduako G, Ibeneme G. Hand hygiene practices among physiotherapists in an ebola endemic region: Implication for public health. *Physiotherapy (United Kingdom)*. Published online 2015.

Nelson AR, Fiedler A, Zikeh T, Moses N, Ruparelia C, Oseni L. Institutionalizing infection prevention and control practices in health facilities in liberia following the Ebola epidemic. *American Journal of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene*. Published online 2018.

## **Duplicate Study**

Brill FH, Siddharta A, Pfaender S, Vielle NJ, et al. Virucidal Activity of World Health Organization– Recommended Formulations Against Enveloped Viruses, Including Zika, Ebola, and Emerging Coronaviruses. *The Journal of Infectious Diseases*. 2017;215(6):902-906. doi:10.1093/infdis/jix046

Squire JS, Conteh I, Abrahamya A, et al. Gaps in Infection Prevention and Control in Public Health Facilities of Sierra Leone after the 2014–2015 Ebola Outbreak. *TropicalMed.* 2021;6(2):89. doi:10.3390/tropicalmed6020089

## Appendix 2. Eligibility Criteria

Question (11)-(a): Should health workers providing direct or indirect care to patients with Ebola or Marburg disease in ETUs and healthcare facilities wash hands (soap & water) OR wash the glove (soap & water) between patients?

Setting	Health care facilities, ETU
Population	Health workers working in health
	care facilities, ETU
Background interventions	1) Disinfect outer gloves before
(Standard of care)	removing them and 2) keep inner
	gloves on and disinfect them before
	putting on a fresh outer pair.
Intervention	Hand hygiene (including glove
	disinfection) between patients
Comparator(s)	<ol> <li>Removal of outer glove and hand hygiene (inner glove) w/ soap and water</li> <li>Removal of both gloves and hand hygiene w/ soap and water</li> <li>Disinfecting outer glove w/ soap and water</li> </ol>
Outcome	Dermatitis, PPE breaches/exposures, compliance, Ebola or Marburg virus infection,
	<u>human factors, health worker confidence</u>
Potential effect modifiers	May depend on the nature of the patient contact (e.g., if there was contact with blood/body fluids or if the outer glove is visibly dirty) Single-use versus reusable gloves <u>Type of gloves (e.g.: nitrile versus latex</u> <u>Number of times inner / outer gloves are disinfected</u>

<u>Health facility versus ETU Setting,</u> <u>vaccination</u>

Question (11)-(b): Should health workers providing direct or indirect care to patients with Ebola or Marburg disease in ETUs and healthcare facilities disinfect hands with ABHR OR disinfect the glove with ABHR between patients?

Setting	Health care facilities, ETU
Population	Health workers working in health
	care facilities, ETU
Background interventions	1) Disinfect outer gloves before
(Standard of care)	removing them and 2) keep inner
	gloves on and disinfect them before
	putting on a fresh outer pair.
Intervention	Hand hygiene (including glove
	disinfection) between patients
Comparator(s)	<ol> <li>Removal of outer glove and hand hygiene (inner glove) w/ alcohol-based hand rub</li> <li>Removal of both gloves and hand hygiene w/ alcohol-based hand rub</li> <li>Disinfecting outer glove w/ alcohol-based hand rub</li> </ol>
Outcome	Dermatitis, PPE
	breaches/exposures, compliance,
	Ebola or Marburg virus infection,
	human factors, health worker confidence
Potential effect modifiers	May depend on the nature of the patient contact (e.g., if there was contact with blood/body fluids or if the outer glove is visibly dirty) Single-use versus reusable gloves

<u>Type of gloves (e.g.: nitrile versus latex</u> <u>Number of times inner / outer gloves are</u>
<u>disinfected</u> <u>Health facility versus ETU Setting.</u> maximation
<u>vaccination</u>

Question (11)-(c): Should health workers providing direct or indirect care to patients with Ebola or Marburg disease in ETUs and healthcare facilities disinfect hands (with chlorine) OR disinfect the glove(with chlorine) between patients?

Setting	Health care facilities, ETU
Population	Health workers working in health
	care facilities, ETU
Background interventions	1) Disinfect outer gloves before
(Standard of care)	removing them and 2) keep inner
	gloves on and disinfect them before
	putting on a fresh outer pair.
Intervention	Hand hygiene (including glove
	disinfection) between patients
Comparator(s)	<ol> <li>Removal of outer glove and hand hygiene (inner glove) w/ chlorine</li> <li>Removal of both gloves and hand hygiene w/ chlorine</li> <li>Disinfecting outer glove w/ chlorine (concentration)</li> </ol>
Outcome	Dermatitis, PPE
	breaches/exposures, compliance,
	Ebola or Marburg virus infection,
	<u>human factors, health worker confidence</u>
Potential effect modifiers	May depend on the nature of the patient contact (e.g., if there was

contact with blood/body fluids or if
the outer glove is visibly dirty)
Single-use versus reusable gloves
<u>Type of gloves (e.g.: nitrile versus latex</u>
Number of times inner / outer gloves are
<u>disinfected</u>
<u>Health facility versus ETU Setting,</u>
<u>vaccination</u>